English 1A Spring 2012 **Peer Editing Worksheet: Book Club Response Essay**

Writer:\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_Reviewer:\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

for the writer:
1. What is **your thesis**? (Remember that it should be an arguable statement, ideally a claim with reasons, and not a cliché.) Please put a star by it on the draft.

2. **What is your audience and forum** (who you want to read it and where you’d publish it so they’d find it)? Be specific! Don’t say “a blog.”

3. What in particular do you want the reviewer to check?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
For the reviewer: Write answers on the back of this sheet if necessary.

1. Do **the title and opening paragraph** catch your interest? Is it fairly clear what this will be about? Does the opening establish what book is being discussed and what other writer (e.g. a book reviewer) is being answered? What might make it clearer or more interesting?

2. Is **the thesis** **clear, adequate, and arguable**? (Note: it doesn’t absolutely need to be in the beginning, but it probably should be.) Warn them, especially, if it seems really obvious (not arguable) or unclear?

3. Is the **thesis supported adequately by material from the book**? What **other kinds of support** (for example, personal stories of parenting from the writer’s life, for the Tiger Mother memoir) might be brought in? (You might need to discuss this with the writer.) Note: There should be enough support from the book to make this a genuine book club project.

4. **How is the citing**? Are quotations worked in gracefully enough? Are the words and ideas of others properly cited? Mark any spots that look problematic to you. Ask the professor is neither of you is sure.

5. How does **the writer’s ethos** come across, judging, if you can, as the intended audience would?

6. As a reader, are you left with **any questions** about the issue that should be further clarified or supported? What might readers like to know more about? Be as specific as you can.

7. **What do you like best** about the essay?