English 1A **Peer Review Worksheet: Critical Analysis Essay**   
  
Writer:\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Reviewer:\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_   
  
for the writer:   
1. What is your **thesis**? Where is it? (Put an asterisk by it on the draft.)  
  
  
2. **Audience & forum** (the target readers & where you’d publish it) Please be specific! Don’t say “a blog.”  
  
3. What are your **criteria**? (acting, plot, theme, cinematography, etc.)  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_   
For the reviewer: Write answers on the back of this sheet if necessary.

1. Are the **title and introduction** engaging enough to draw in the intended readers? ­­­­\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
Does the introduction contain an overview of the topic that orients the reader to the issue in its current context? \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Does it look like the writer has focused the topic narrowly enough to deal with it adequately in a relatively short paper? \_\_\_\_\_\_\_

2. Is the **thesis** clear and reasonable, considering the evidence provided? \_\_\_\_\_ If it would be stronger with more support, what kind of support might help?

3. **Are the criteria used to evaluate the item clear enough?** Do they seem appropriate? Are there enough of them but not too many? Which criteria might be added (or removed)?

4. **Is there enough support (i.e. description, examples)** to adequately support the writer’s claims about the film? If not, which claim needs more support? You might also recommend what kind of support.

5. **Is there at least one other critic referred to and cited properly** (in the style usual for newspapers)? Note: Within the text of the review, the quote or paraphrase should be cited as in a newspaper, with enough info in the ID tag to give credit and let your reader find more. See p. 165-168 in the text for a model and p. 507 for an explanation.

6. Is there **analysis** **as well as evaluation** (interpreting a theme, providing historical or cultural context, explaining how the film achieves its impact, where it fits into its genre or the director’s body of work, etc)? If not, alert the writer that he/she isn’t finished!

7. Comment on the **organization and coherence** of each paragraph. Are the **transitions** between paragraphs adequate but not mechanical or repetetive? \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Mark on the draft where you see any problems.

8**.** Is there **too much plot retelling**? Is it told in one undigested lump? If either of these common problems is evident, WARN the writer and suggest a better way to handle this.

9. **What do you like best** about the essay?